OFF TO A GOOD START
Early Childhood Education in Denver

“We urge decision makers in the public and private sectors to make early childhood education a high priority.”

- The Business Roundtable

This presentation is current as of June 2006. For more information please call 303-825-6246.
Project Support Provided by…

Temple Hoyne Buell Foundation

Donnell-Kay Foundation

Daniels Fund

Chambers Family Fund
Purpose and Overview

The purpose of this presentation – to provide objective information about early childhood care and education to Denver’s citizens.

1. The Promise of Early Childhood Education (ECE): Three main reasons why ECE makes sense
2. The Challenge of ECE: Two major problems the ECE system faces
3. The Opportunity for ECE: How to improve ECE; local initiatives that are improving ECE
4. What’s Next?: Collaboration is needed to improve ECE
What is ECE and Why Does It Make Sense?

1. The Promise

● What is ECE?
  - Child development and early learning
  - Based on brain research
  - Variety of providers

● Why does ECE make sense?
  - High return on investment
  - Today’s workforce
  - Tomorrow’s workforce
What Is ECE?


- *Not* babysitting. ECE is also called:
  - child care
  - day care
  - nursery school
  - preschool
  - school readiness
  - child development

What does ECE look like?
What Is ECE?

ECE happens in a variety of settings:

- Child care centers and family child care homes
- Friends’ or relatives’ homes (“kith and kin”)
- Schools
- Businesses
- Churches and synagogues
- A child’s own home

ECE is provided by licensed and unlicensed providers:

- In Denver over 500 facilities offer approximately 21,000 licensed or legally exempt slots, mostly for 3-5 year olds.

1 Qualistar Early Learning, Spring 2006, 2 Denver Human Services, March 2006
Why ECE Makes Sense

Reason #1: ECE is a good investment.

- For every $1 spent on ECE, between $4 and $17 dollars are saved over time in 1:
  - special education
  - health care
  - “welfare” payments
  - criminal justice

- Nationally, BILLIONS of dollars would be added to our economy over time if ECE were a reality for our poorest 3 and 4 year olds. 2

Why ECE Makes Sense

Reason #1: ECE is a good investment.

- One study suggests that school districts can save up to $11,000 per child attending quality ECE, due to decreased special education and remediation costs.¹

- The Colorado Preschool Program saved school districts statewide almost $23 million over five years in special education costs by serving 1,300 “at-risk” children.²

- ECE industry in Denver generates an additional $1.77 in output in terms of jobs, services and products for every $1 spent on ECE.³

¹ Steven Barnett and Leonard N. Masse, A Benefit Cost Analysis of the Abecedarian Early Childhood Intervention, 2002. ², ³ The Economic Impact of Child Care in Colorado, Colorado Children’s Campaign, 2004
Why ECE Makes Sense

Reason #2: ECE helps businesses attract and retain a productive workforce today.

- A majority of parents with children under age five are working and their young children are cared for outside the home\(^1\).

- At a minimum, over 33,000 children in Denver need some form of ECE so their parents can work\(^2\).

---

\(^1\) *Denver Parent Demand Survey, garnerinsights, Nov 2004; see also 1999 National Household Education Survey* (National Center for Education Statistics, U.S. Department of Education)  
\(^2\) *American Community Survey 2004 (US Census Bureau)*
Reason #2: ECE helps businesses attract and retain a productive workforce today.

- In order to keep their jobs, 61% of Denver parents with children under age five in ECE said they must have access to such programs.¹

- Parents who feel secure about ECE arrangements are late to work less often and miss fewer days of work.²

¹ Denver Parent Demand Survey, garnerinsights, Nov 2004  
² Benefits of Work-Site Child Care, Simmons College, 1997
Reason #3: ECE prepares a productive workforce for tomorrow.

Over 40 years of ongoing research shows that quality ECE means success in school and life.

- Better prepared for school
- Better test scores
- Less remediation
- Less crime
- Higher high school graduation rates
- Higher college attendance rates
- More highly skilled workforce
- Higher lifetime earnings
- Higher GDP
Denver’s low income children have a greater chance of reading at grade level or above when they have Pre-K and full day kindergarten.

Source: The Piton Perspective, Summer 2006
Denver’s children, especially those from low income families, score higher when they have had ECE.
ECE Faces Two Main Challenges

2. The Challenge

- **Quality matters** – Only quality ECE programs are effective, yet most programs are poor to mediocre.

- **There is a quality gap** – Quality ECE is costly and most parents cannot afford the costs.
Quality ECE is in short supply.

- According to one study, 85% of all Colorado programs are poor to mediocre.¹

- Only 6% of Denver’s ECE programs (about 30) are accredited² by the National Association for the Education of Young Children.

¹ M. Culkin et al Cost, Quality and Outcomes in Child Care Centers, 1995. ² Colorado Association for the Education of Young Children as of Spring 2006
Poor to mediocre programs do not help children get ready for school.

- Colorado kindergarten teachers report that at least 1/3 of children come to school unprepared to learn.\(^1\)

- Research shows that kindergarteners who start school behind tend to stay behind.\(^2\)

---

\(^1\)First Ever Statewide K-1 Teacher Survey on School Readiness, Educare and Colorado Children’s Campaign, 2002

Quality Matters

Quality ECE is especially important for “at-risk” children.

“At-risk” children tend to:

- benefit more from quality ECE programs and be hurt more by poor and mediocre programs.¹

- come to school with fewer basic skills than higher income peers.²

- use formal ECE less often than higher income children.³

¹ M. Culkin et al The Children of Cost, Quality and Outcomes Go to School, 1999  
² numerous sources – see linked slides  
³ garnerinsight, Denver Parent Demand Survey, 2004
Why is Quality Often Lacking?

Quality ECE programs need well-educated and trained teachers, yet...

- The ECE industry has trouble attracting and keeping talent because ECE teacher pay is so low.
  - A private ECE teacher generally earns 3/4 of what a beginning Denver Public Schools teacher makes.\(^1\)
  - Metro Denver has a child care worker staff turnover rate of 25% per year, compared to an average of 9.6% for all U.S. industries.\(^2\)

- Only 18 states require preschool teachers to have a bachelor’s degree; Colorado is NOT one of those states.

\(^1\) CO Dept of Labor and Employment, Denver Public Schools  \(^2\) *Who Is Watching Our Kids?*, Qualistar Early Learning, 2002
Who Pays for Educational Opportunities in Denver by Age of Child?

Local & State Funds  Federal Funds  Parents

Sources: Voices for Children, Colorado Children's Campaign 2004, Qualistar Early Learning 2005 market rate survey, University of Colorado
Who Pays for ECE?

ECE is paid by four main sources:

- Parents
- The Public (Federal, State and Local Gov’t)
- Philanthropy
- Business
How Does Brain Development Compare with Public Expenditures?

Percent of Total Brain Development

Cumulative Percent of Total Public $ Spent on Children

There Is A Quality Gap

ECE costs EVEN MORE when it is quality.

What Might Providers Have to Charge per Child per Year for a Quality Program?

- **Preschooler**: Current Price $10,996, Quality Price $16,051
- **Toddler**: Current Price $8,320, Quality Price $14,529
- **Infant**: Current Price $9,880

Source: Qualistar 2005 Market Rate Survey
There Is A Quality Gap

ECE = market failure: high cost with no quality guarantees.

Teachers have little incentive to be well-trained or remain employed.

ECE is labor intensive and requires well-trained teachers.

No market incentive for improvement

Parents cannot pay enough to raise wages.

Wages are low, but labor costs are high overall.
Major opportunities to improve ECE through collaboration:

- **Improve quality** – Quality can be improved with investment.

- **Address the quality gap** – Quality ECE must be affordable for all families.
Better quality means better outcomes for children.

- ECE programs can improve quality with incentives, training and resources.
  - Of 37 sites rated in Denver by Qualistar between 2003-2006, 92% either increased to or maintained a high quality rating due to additional investment.¹
  - 95% of sites that began at 2 stars increased to 3 stars by the end of three years.²

- Over 300 early childhood staff in Denver have earned Early Childhood Professional Credentials.
  - 58% are at Levels I-III and 42% are at Levels IV-VI.³

¹,²,³ Denver Early Childhood Council (Joint Council)
Address the Quality Gap

Funding can improve quality.

What Might Quality ECE Cost per Year for All Children Who Currently use ECE?

_Total Funds Needed for Quality:_ $322 m/yr

- **Quality Gap:** $103 m
- **Current Denver ECE Market:** $219 m

Source: Author’s analysis
Local Initiatives

- Denver Mayor Hickenlooper’s ECE initiative called Invest In Success is led by a team of business leaders. The Mayor’s Early Childhood Education Commission and The Joint Council support the initiative as well.

- Preschool Denver is an initiative to make preschool available to all kids

- Qualistar Early Learning (formerly Educare and CORRA) works on improving ECE quality with Quality Ratings and referrals for parents.

- Smart Start Colorado is a state-wide alliance dedicated to creating a comprehensive early childhood system.
Together We Can Improve ECE

4. What’s Next?

- Conclusions
- Next steps
Conclusions

1. **ECE makes sense.** We should take advantage of years of research and irrefutable evidence and implement what we know to be true.

2. **Pay now or pay (more) later.** ECE is a cost-effective funding strategy. Investing in children early avoids paying for more expensive interventions later and wasting K-12 dollars.

3. **Quality matters.** The promise of ECE holds true only for quality programs, yet the current system does not pay for quality.

4. **There is a quality gap.** Quality ECE is costly. Most parents cannot afford the costs alone.

5. **Collaboration is needed.** Philanthropy, schools, providers, community groups, parents and government can work together to solve the problems of quality, affordability and inadequate overall funding.
The funders commit to:

- Funding innovative programs, research and quality improvement efforts.
- Helping others learn about ECE – give this presentation to public and private leaders.
- Shining a spotlight on this issue – encourage the media and organizations to focus on ECE.
- Convening leaders to tackle the problems together – collaborate with organizations working in unison to improve ECE.
- Calling for and gathering better data.
Next Steps

What will you do?
Special Thanks to…. 

- Chambers Family Fund – Letty Bass
- The Clayton Foundation – Nancie Linville
- Colorado Children’s Campaign – Bruce Atchison, Andrew Brodsky, Jennifer Landrum, Alex Medler
- Colorado Department of Education – Lori Bowers, Jenna Davis, Sharon Triolo-Maloney
- Colorado Department of Public Health & Environment – Rachel Hutson
- Colorado Division of Child Care – Scott Raun
- Daniels Fund – Jason Gaulden
- Denver Department of Human Services – Valerie Brooks, Jay Morein, Juanita Sanchez
- Denver Early Childhood Council – Meg Franko
- The Denver Foundation – Rebecca Arno, Lauren Casteel, Astrid Spies
- Denver Public Schools – Cheryl Caldwell, John Crawford
- Donnell-Kay Foundation – Tony Lewis
- Head Start – Pam Harris, Manuel Escamilla
- Qualistar – Paula Neth, Bryan Shultz, Gerrit Westervelt
- Mayor’s Office for Education and Children – Susan Gallo, Maria Guajardo Lucero
- The Piton Foundation – Matt Barry, Pamela Buckley, Lisa Roy
- Rose Community Foundation – Elsa Holguin
- Smart Start Colorado – Teri Pinney
- Temple Hoyne Buell Foundation – Susan Steele
- Others: Stacy Baum, Alison Birchard, Marsha Gould, Suzanne Helburn, Mimi Howard, Cary Kennedy, Gail Wilson, Brad Udall (technical consultant)
Additional Resources

- **Child Care Aware**
  - Find information on child care, free publications for parents, tax tips. [www.childcareaware.org](http://www.childcareaware.org)

- **Children's Defense Fund**
  - Receive free emails about ECE, child health and other topics; get free parenting resources; join child advocacy campaigns. [www.childrensdefense.org](http://www.childrensdefense.org)

- **Child Trends**
  - Get free publications and the latest research and science-based information on a variety of child and family issues. [www.childtrends.org](http://www.childtrends.org)

- **Colorado Children’s Campaign**
  - Keep up to date on issues and legislation affecting children; get KidsCount data. [www.coloradokids.org](http://www.coloradokids.org)

- **Colorado Parent Information and Resource Center**
  - Clearinghouse provides weekly information for parents and caregivers. [www.cpirc.org](http://www.cpirc.org)
Additional Resources

- **Connect for Children**
  - A massive clearinghouse of kid-related news and programs; get free weekly email updates. [www.connectforkids.org](http://www.connectforkids.org)

- **I Am Your Child**

- **National Center for Infants, Toddlers & Families Zero to Three**
  - Learn about brain development, early literacy and more; get resources for both professionals and parents. [www.zerotothree.org](http://www.zerotothree.org)

- **National Center for Early Development and Learning**
  - A national early childhood research project supported by the US Dept. of Education, operated by The Frank Porter Graham Child Development Center, NC-Chapel Hill. [www.fpg.unc.edu/~ncedl](http://www.fpg.unc.edu/~ncedl)
Additional Resources

- **The National Child Care Information Center**
  - Get national child care data, research and links to US government programs from The National Child Care Information Center (NCCIC). [www.nccic.org](http://www.nccic.org)

- **National Institute for Early Education Research**
  - Get the latest ECE research and data. [www.nieer.org](http://www.nieer.org)

- **Pre-K Now**
  - National website with resources for policymakers, business and community leaders, educators and families. [www.preknow.org](http://www.preknow.org)

- **Preschool Denver**
  - Learn why quality preschool plays a critical role in Denver’s future and join the effort. [www.preschooldenver.org](http://www.preschooldenver.org)

- **Qualistar Early Learning**
  - Get free referrals and quality ratings for local child care centers and homes; learn what makes for high quality child care. [www.qualistar.org](http://www.qualistar.org)

- **Smart Start Colorado**
  - Learn about this collaborative to build a statewide early childhood system. [www.smartstartcolorado.org](http://www.smartstartcolorado.org)
Supporting Slides

- Following slides are additional, optional, hypertext-linked slides for the previous presentation slides.
Imagine you are 3-year old John…

- You play with a shovel in sand and water, learning about weight and volume.
- You draw and paint, gaining fine motor skills that will help you write later on.
- You listen to your teacher read a story, learning about books and vocabulary.
- You play dress up with your friends, gaining social skills and creativity.

- John knows he’s having **fun**.
- We know he’s **learning and getting ready for school**.

Mr. Rogers said:
"Play is often talked about as if it were a relief from serious learning. But for children play is serious learning. Play is really the work of childhood."
Child Care Centers and Child Care Homes

- **Child Care Centers** are large, typically serving over 15 children and up to over 100 children. They can be operated as a for-profit or a non-profit company. In Denver, most centers are non-profits. The average occupancy is 85 children.¹

- **Family Child Care Homes** are small, serving no more than 6 children. They are usually operated by an individual or family.

¹ *Child Care in Denver: A Market Rate Survey, 2002.* Center for Human Investment Policy
ECE Facilities Locations

Child Care Center
Family Child Care
Preschool Program
School Age Program
ECE Capacity vs. Population Locations
Usable ECE Slots in Denver

- **School Age Program, 4500 (21%)**
- **Preschool 3,636 (17%)**
- **Licensed Family Home 1,664 (8%)**
- **Licensed Center 10,820 (51%)**
- **Exempt Care 596 (3%)**

Source: Qualistar Early Learning and Denver Human Services as of May 2006
ECE Provider Licensing

- States are required to regulate the **health, safety, and well-being** of children in out-of-home settings and to provide support and quality control services to ECE providers.

- The **Division of Child Care in the Department of Human Services** is Colorado's licensing agency. The Division:
  - plans and implements public policy on ECE issues
  - inspects, licenses, and monitors approximately 10,000 child care facilities in Colorado
  - manages child care assistance (subsidy) programs for low-income families
  - serves as the lead agency in implementing federal child care programs.
Cost-Benefit Analysis of ECE

For every $1 invested, ECE provides $4 to $17 in benefits.

Results from ECE Studies

- **The Carolina Abecedarian Project** found that children who were in high quality ECE from infancy through age 5…
  - had higher cognitive scores from the toddler years to age 21
  - were more likely to attend college
  - were generally older when their first child was born

- **Chicago’s Child-Parent Centers** program showed that children who participated when they were 3 or 4 years old were…
  - more likely to finish high school
  - less likely to be held back a grade
  - less likely to be arrested than children who did not participate

- **High/Scope Perry Preschool Project** showed that participating children had…
  - fewer criminal arrests
  - higher earnings
  - greater commitment to marriage
  - higher high school graduation rates
It costs Denverites nearly twice as much to incarcerate one prisoner each year than to send one toddler to ECE.

Source: Colorado Department of Justice, 2004
ECE Helps Our Economy

Early Childhood Education would boost Gross Domestic Product through increased earnings.

How Much Do ECE Benefits Exceed Costs in Terms of GDP?

Equal to $107 Billion in increased earnings

Quality ECE means reduced absenteeism and improved productivity.

- 80% of employers report that child care problems force employees to lose work time, costing companies $600-$1,000 per employee per year. ³

- 45% of parents miss at least one day of work every 6 months due to child care breakdown. These parents miss an average of 4.3 days every 6 months.¹

- 65% of parents are late to work, or leave early, due to child care issues, on average 7.5 times every six months.²

¹ Benefits of Work-Site Child Care, Simmons College, 1997 ² Bright Horizons and Child Care Trends 2002 ³ National Conference of State Legislatures and Bright Horizons and Child Care Trends, 2002
How Many Children Under Age 5 Live in Denver?

How Many Children Age 5 and Under Need ECE Because All Available Parents Work?

- Need Some Form of ECE: 64.6%
- Do Not Need ECE: 35.4%

Source: American Community Survey 2004 (US Census Bureau)
Type of ECE Use by Age of Child

What Type of ECE Do Denver Children Use?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Other</th>
<th>Formal ECE</th>
<th>Informal ECE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age 2 and younger</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 3</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>66%</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 4</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>76%</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age 5</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Denver Parent Demand Survey, garnerinsights, Nov 2004
How Does ECE Affect IQ?

Affect of Quality ECE on IQ

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Child Age</th>
<th>No ECE Control Group</th>
<th>Abecedarian ECE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6 Months</td>
<td>93%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 Months</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36 Months</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>95%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48 Months</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>95%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

How Did Quality ECE at DPS Prepare "At-Risk" Children for Kindergarten?

Source: analysis of data provided by Mary Ann Bash, Denver Public Schools.

Attended ECE in high quality DPS classrooms

Did Not Attend ECE in these classrooms

Average % of Alphabet Known at 2001 Kindergarten Start

Native English

- 48% (n = 574)
- 66% (n = 3203)

Native Spanish

- 13% (n = 196)
- 50% (n = 1296)
ECE Means Stronger Readers

How Do Colorado ECE Classrooms Rate?

- Mediocre: 78%
- Good or Better: 15%
- Poor: 7%

Source: Cost, Quality and Child Outcomes in Child Care Centers: Colorado Report, 1996, University of Colorado at Denver
NAEYC Accreditation

- Founded in 1926, The National Association for the Education of Young Children (NAEYC) is the nation's largest organization of early childhood educators and others dedicated to improving the quality of programs for children from birth through 3rd grade.
  - www.naeyc.org

- NAEYC administers a voluntary accreditation system to help raise the quality of all types of ECE programs. Accredited programs must meet certain criteria in areas such as staffing, curriculum and physical environment.

- Colorado has its own NAEYC chapter, called the Colorado Association for the Education of Young Children (CAEYC) and the Metro Denver Area has a CAEYC “district group.”
  - www.coloradoaeyc.org/
What Are the Most Important Skills for Kindergarten?

Source: First Ever Statewide K-1 Teacher Survey on School Readiness, Qualistar and Colorado Children's Campaign, 2002
Denver Children Living in Poverty

Children in DPS ECE or Kindergarten from 2000/01 to 2004/05 who qualify for free and reduced lunch

% of Children who Qualified for Free and Reduced Lunch, 65%

% of Children who Pay for Lunch, 35%

Source: Denver Public Schools, 2005-06 school year
Relative to their percentage in the population, children of color are disproportionately poor.

Source: 2004 American Community Survey (US Census Bureau)
For Every 100 Children Born in Denver…

- 7 are born to mothers who smoked during pregnancy.
- 29 are born to mothers who received late or no prenatal care.
- 10 are born with low birth weight.
- 11 are born to teen mothers.
- 33 are born to a single mother.
- 37 are born to a mother with no high school diploma.
- 39 are born to an immigrant mother.

### Federal 2006 Poverty Guidelines

#### 2006 HHS Poverty Guidelines

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Size of Family</th>
<th>Poverty Level</th>
<th>130% of Poverty Level</th>
<th>185% of Poverty Level</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>$ 9,800</td>
<td>$ 12,740</td>
<td>$ 18,130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>$ 13,200</td>
<td>$ 17,160</td>
<td>$ 24,420</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>$ 16,600</td>
<td>$ 21,580</td>
<td>$ 30,710</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>$ 20,000</td>
<td>$ 26,000</td>
<td>$ 37,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>$ 23,400</td>
<td>$ 30,420</td>
<td>$ 43,290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>$ 26,800</td>
<td>$ 34,840</td>
<td>$ 49,580</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>$ 30,200</td>
<td>$ 39,260</td>
<td>$ 55,870</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>$ 33,600</td>
<td>$ 43,680</td>
<td>$ 62,160</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For each additional person add:

| For each additional person add | $ 3,400 | $ 4,420 | $ 6,290 |

Source: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services
Higher Income Children Are More Ready for School

Number of Upper Case Letters Recognized by 2001 Incoming DPS Kindergarteners

- All DPS Elementary Schools: Mean 8, Median 10.99
- Schools > 70% Free/Reduced Lunch: Mean 4, Median 8.15
- Schools > 90% Free/Reduced Lunch: Mean 3, Median 7.34

Source: analysis of Denver Public Schools data
Ongoing research suggests that a complex set of factors – not the racial and ethnic makeup of children – accounts for most of the gaps in children’s readiness for school\(^1\), including:

- Family socioeconomic status
- Child health
- Maternal health and behaviors
- Preschool experiences

How Are Higher Income Children Ready for School?

% Kindergarteners Scoring in High Quartile by Maternal Education

How Are Higher Income Children Ready for School?

Children from Higher Income Families Have Higher Vocabularies by Age 3

- Children Living in Poverty: 480 words
- Children of Middle Socio-Economic Status: 750 words
- Children of Professionals: 1,100 words

How Are Higher Income Children Ready for School?

Parents Who Read Daily to their Children

Source: National Center for Children in Poverty, News and Issues, Fall 2002
Which Denver Families with Children under Age 5 Use ECE?

- **Annual Household Income**
  - Under $30,000: 70% Use ECE, 30% Do NOT Use ECE
  - $30,000 - $60,000: 47% Use ECE, 53% Do NOT Use ECE
  - $60,000 and above: 31% Use ECE, 69% Do NOT Use ECE

Source: *Denver Parent Demand Survey*, garnerinsights, Nov 2004
How Much Do Child Care Workers Earn?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Job Category</th>
<th>Denver Median Hourly Wages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DPS Teacher*</td>
<td>$33.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Librarian</td>
<td>$25.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clergy</td>
<td>$21.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aerobics Instructor</td>
<td>$15.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Butcher</td>
<td>$16.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Bus Driver</td>
<td>$13.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>File Clerk</td>
<td>$11.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Preschool Teacher</td>
<td>$10.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Janitor</td>
<td>$10.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-farm Animal Caretaker</td>
<td>$9.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child Care Worker</td>
<td>$9.32</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Colorado Department of Labor and Employment 2004 (inflated to 2006 dollars)

*2005 Estimated hourly wage based on average salary of $52,271 (inflated to 2006 dollars)
Price of ECE in Denver

What do Providers Charge per Year for ECE in Denver?

Source: Qualistar, 2005 market rate survey (75th percentile)
How Difficult is it to Pay for ECE?

ECE is like a 2nd mortgage for most families.¹

Annual Family Expenses for One Adult & One Preschooler Living in Denver on "Self-Sufficiency" Wage of $34,918²

- Taxes 17%
- Housing 35%
- Food 12%
- Transport 12%
- Health Care 10%
- Misc 9%
- ECE 22%

¹ 2003 American Community Survey (US Census Bureau) ² The Self-Sufficiency Standard for Colorado 2004, Colorado Fiscal Policy Institute
How Difficult is it to Acquire ECE?

Of Denver parents with children under age 5 who use ECE:

- Half report having problems finding ECE for their children.
- 90% report receiving NO outside financial support or subsidies.

Source: Denver Parent Demand Survey, garnerinsights, 2004
How Difficult is it to Acquire ECE?

Many parents have to piece together several different programs for one child.

- John Smith is a preschool child of two working parents.
  - Monday-Friday mornings are at a state-sponsored Colorado Preschool Program class.
  - Tuesday, Wednesday, Thursday afternoons he’s at a licensed child care home.
  - Monday and Friday afternoons he stays with an unlicensed neighbor.

- In total $7,381 is spent, 58% paid for by parents.
A family with two children making the Denver County Median Income of $44,000 could claim $8,800 for federal and $880 for state.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Annual Income</th>
<th>Federal</th>
<th>State</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&lt;$15,000</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$15,000 - $17,000</td>
<td>34%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$17,000 - $19,000</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$19,000 - $21,000</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$21,000 - $23,000</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$23,000 - $25,000</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$25,000 - $27,000</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$27,000 - $29,000</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$29,000 - $31,000</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$31,000 - $33,000</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$33,000 - $35,000</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$35,000 - $37,000</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$37,000 - $39,000</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$39,000 - $41,000</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$41,000 - $43,000</td>
<td>21%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt;$43,000</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: IRS Publication 503, Colorado DOR Publication Income 33
Funded ECE Programs in Denver

- **Colorado Child Care Assistance Program** (CCCAP)
- **Colorado Preschool Program** (CPP)
- **Early Reading First**
- **Head Start and Early Head Start**
- **Denver Public Schools** (DPS)
- **Other Programs**
  - Special Education
  - Mental Health
  - Home Visitation
Philanthropic ECE Contributions

- Philanthropy does not replace operating costs in any system.

- Private foundations typically do NOT pay for ECE tuition. Foundation grants generally fund:
  - equipment and materials
  - quality improvement efforts
  - professional development and training
  - special programs, etc.

- By law foundations cannot grant money to for-profit organizations; foundations can grant to non-profits, schools, and governmental agencies.
Findings from a 2003 Hewitt Associates study of 975 large U.S. companies found that:

- 10 percent offered company-subsidized on-site or near-site ECE
- 9 percent arranged for discounts from local child-care providers
- 42 percent offered child care referral services
- 94 percent gave employees an opportunity to put aside pre-tax earnings for child care in flexible spending accounts (FSAs)
The Colorado Child Care Assistance Program (CCCAP) allows *working* low-income families to receive ECE.

- A federally-funded voucher program run by county governments – the county pays ECE providers directly for services rendered.

- Families apply to CCCAP *and* find a provider willing to accept its payments.

- To qualify, a family of four can make no more than $37,000 or 185% of the Federal Poverty Guideline.
CCCAP Funding

- CCCAP is a federally funded program. The state of Colorado receives a **federal block grant** and then distributes the money to counties.

- The City and County of Denver received **$13.6 million** in CCCAP funds for 2005-2006. Of this, $8.8 million are federal, 3.17 million are state, and 1.66 million are local funds.

- The CCCAP funds can be augmented by up to 20% of the current years Temporary Assistance to Needy Families (TANF) allocation. Over the last 6 years over **$43 million additional dollars** from TANF were transferred to increase CCCAP funding.

Source: Denver Department of Human Services
CCCAP Funding

How Much Denver CCCAP Funding?
in Millions of $

Source: Denver Human Services  * TANF transfer figure includes 6.9M TANF transfer and one-time 4.9M Colorado Works surplus transfer  
** TANF transfer figure includes 6.8M TANF transfer and one-time 576K transfer of other counties' surplus CCCAP funds
How Much Does Denver Spend on CCCAP vs. How Much It Receives?

Source: Denver Department of Human Services
CCCAP Impact

- In 2005, **2,994 Denver children used CCCAP funds**, 1,795 of them under age 5.¹

- **CCCAP allows parents to work.** 92% of the families receiving CCCAP funds have jobs. 25% of families who leave TANF move to CCCAP.²

- Statewide, only about 14% of eligible children are actually served.³

---

¹, ² Denver Department of Human Services ³ Colorado Department of Human Services
How Many Denver Children Are Served by CCCAP?

Source: Denver Department of Human Services
In July 2003, a freeze was placed on CCCAP enrollment for non-TANF eligible families due to lack of funding.

The freeze was lifted in August of 2004, but enrollment numbers are still down. DHS currently has the capacity to enroll approximately 700 more children a year in CCCAP. Extensive outreach is underway to increase enrollment.

Savings from decreased enrollment ($2.5 million) were transferred to MOEC in June of 2005 for quality improvements in child care centers. DHS is determining how to distribute 2 million in savings for the current fiscal year.
The Colorado Preschool Program (CPP) prepares “at-risk” 3 to 5 year olds for school.

- CPP is a part-day, part-year program delivered by local schools and community ECE providers.

- To qualify for CPP, children must be at risk of school failure due to poverty, language abilities, family circumstances, etc.
The **Colorado Preschool Program** (CPP) is Colorado’s *only* state general-funded ECE program. It provides funds for 50% of a full time student through the School Finance Act.

For the 2005-06 school year, Denver Public Schools received about $7.6 million ($3,173 per student x 2,087 “slots”) for both ECE and some Kindergarten.

548 of DPS’s CPP slots are contracted out to community ECE providers.

Source: Denver Public Schools
CPP students are identified by schools to be at risk of school failure. Even so, they “catch up” to their peers, scoring very near the state average by the 3rd grade CSAP.¹

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>District Average</th>
<th>CPP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

¹ Denver Public Schools
An estimated 1300 children avoid special education due to their participation in CPP, saving school districts $22.8 million over 5 years.¹

If CPP were available to all eligible children statewide, Colorado would receive an estimated $101 million net return.²

¹, ² The Economic Impact of Child Care in Colorado, Colorado Children’s Campaign, 2005
CPP Policy Update

- CPP was cut in 2003 by the Colorado Legislature due to the budget shortfall. **DPS lost 250 slots for ECE** plus 119 slots for full-day Kindergarten. Cuts were restored in 2005-06 and an additional 385 preschool slots were added.

- Statewide, over 5,600 eligible children are not served through CPP due to lack of funds.¹

- Of all 50 states, only Georgia and Oklahoma guarantee preschool for all 4-year olds.

- Governor Owens recently **vetoed HB-1397** which would have increased ECE funding statewide, indicating that substantial funds had already been committed to restore CPP slots

¹ The Economic Impact of Child Care in Colorado, Colorado Children’s Campaign, 2005
Head Start and Early Head Start prepare low-income children ages 0-5 for school.

- In full- and part-day classrooms:
  - literacy and learning experiences
  - family support
  - health services

- In Denver, provided through two community organizations who deliver services through local ECE providers and DPS:
  - Denver’s Great Kids Head Start
  - Rocky Mountain SER

- To qualify, families must be at or below the Federal Poverty Guideline.
Denver received $12.6 million Head Start funds to serve about 1,900 children in 2005.

Federal funding has been flat for the last 3 years. For FY 2006 there will be no cost of living increase and a 1% reduction in Head Start funding.

An estimated 60% of eligible children are currently served in Denver. About 55% of the participants are 4-year olds.¹

¹ JVA Consulting, Head Start Comprehensive Community Assessment, 2004 and Pamela Harris
Head Start Impact

- Head Start participants show significant gains in:
  - vocabulary,
  - early writing skills,
  - cooperative behavior
  - social relationships¹

- Early Head Start children ages 2 and 3 score higher on cognitive and language development tests than control group children not in the program.²

- According to a study of children in California, Connecticut and Florida, only 30% of 4-year olds whose mothers were on welfare could count to 20 out loud or write their name correctly. Yet 53% of comparable Head Start Children could count to 20, and 66% could write their first name.³

Head Start originally focused on comprehensive child readiness skills and services for the family as well as children.

The Bush Administration is mandating more collaboration and alignment of state standards. A mandatory test measuring vocabulary, letter recognition and math skills for all participating 4 year olds has been instituted but not yet standardized.
Denver Public Schools serve almost 69,000 students.

- 3,954 are in ECE classrooms. 6,394 are in Kindergarten classrooms. (Another 1,000+ Kindergarteners attend non-public schools.)
DPS ECE Programs

DPS ECE programs prepare children for school.

- ECE offered in all but three elementary schools.
- DPS primarily serves 4-year-olds in a part-day program. (Nine schools serve 3-year-olds.)
- DPS funds ECE with a variety of funding streams:
  - Colorado Preschool Program,
  - Head Start
  - Title I
  - General Funds and Mill Levy dollars
  - Parental Tuition
  - Early Reading First
Title 1

- Federal funding to ensure that all children have a fair, equal, and significant opportunity to obtain a high-quality education.

- In Colorado, Title I dollars in support of early childhood education are most often used to supplement the Colorado Preschool Program.

- To qualify for Title 1, children must be 4 yrs old and live in a low income area or be eligible for free/reduced lunch

- DPS received 3.1 million for the 05/06 school year to serve 1116 kids.
Early Reading First

- Early Reading First is a nationwide effort providing funds to local education agencies and public or private organizations that serve children from low-income families.
- Based on the understanding that literacy is a learned skill, not a biological awakening, the initiative promotes coherent, skill-based instruction in the years before kindergarten.
- DPS Received $3.6 million for three years ($1.2 m/year). An additional $800,000 was provided to fund community sites.
Starting in 2003-2004, DPS began charging tuition for ECE students who do not qualify for free ECE or scholarships based on a sliding fee scale. At the same time, Denver voters passed a $3.5 million annual mill levy that included scholarships for ECE students whose families can not afford tuition. 182 ECE students received scholarships in 05-06.

Helen Thorpe and Bruce Hoyt co-chaired the DPS Task Force on Early Education and School Readiness to focus attention on preparing young children from birth to age 5 for future school success.
How Much Money Does DPS Use for ECE?

Source: Denver Public Schools  * for the 03-04 school year, there was some parent pay and it is included in General Fund
DPS Kindergarten programs prepare children for later grades.

- Kindergarten is offered in all DPS elementary schools.

- The state’s School Finance Act funds half-day Kindergarten only, but about 51% of DPS Kindergarteners are in full-day classrooms, funded by:
  - Title I, Colorado Preschool Program, mill levy dollars and tuition.

- Children in DPS full-day Kindergarten show greater improvement in letter and word recognition.¹

¹ Caldwell, Cheryl, Denver Public Schools
In spring 2003, the Colorado State Legislature cut Amendment 23 dollars that were earmarked for full-day Kindergarten in unsatisfactorily performing elementary schools. **DPS lost almost 800 slots, or $2.5 million.**

In fall 2003, Denver voters passed a $3.5 million annual mill levy that included $2.4 million to create 63 full-day Kindergarten classrooms in low income schools. In 05-06, an additional 1,825 children were served in full-day Kindergarten classrooms.

Source: Denver Public Schools
Several studies have shown that high quality full-day kindergarten boosts academic performance, especially for at-risk children.¹

- Minneapolis Public Schools found that full-day kindergarten, especially when coupled with ECE, helped close the achievement gap between white students and students of color.

Full-day Kindergarten pays for itself.

- Philadelphia Public Schools reported saving $2 million for every 1,000 full-day Kindergarteners, primarily from lower remediation rates.

¹ Full-day and Half-day Kindergarten in the United States, National Center for Education Statistics using data from the Early Childhood Longitudinal Study, Kindergarten Class of 1998-99 (ECLS-K)
Young children with disabilities qualify for public assistance.

- The federally funded Individuals with Disabilities Education Act (IDEA) serves disabled children ages 0 – 5.

- In 05-06, Denver served approximately 900 children with disabilities under age 3.

- In 05-06, DPS served 719 ECE children with disabilities.
Mental Health and ECE

One in six Colorado children under age nine has emotional and behavioral problems serious enough to disrupt classrooms.¹

- The Mental Health Center of Denver’s Pearl Project serves over 1,000 children ages 0 – 5 with blended funding from public and private sources.
  - Mental health clinicians do prevention and intervention activities at child care centers, Head Start and Early Head Start facilities and in the child’s home.

- Harambe! is a collaboration aimed at integrating all of Colorado’s existing early childhood mental health efforts to improve child outcomes and get sustainable funding.

¹ Gould, Marsha, Center for Human Investment Policy, October 2000.
Mental Health and ECE

- Teachers in preschool classrooms are coping with a substantial number of young children who struggle with emotional and behavioral problems.

- Young children who lack appropriate social skills participate less in classroom activities and are less likely to be accepted by classmates and teachers.

- Research shows that the emotional, social, and behavioral competence of young children predict their academic performance in first grade over and above their cognitive skills and family backgrounds.

Home Visitation

Home visitation programs help parents help their children succeed.

- Programs typically pair young families with visiting nurses, social workers or volunteers.

- In Denver, four important programs are:
  - Best Babies
  - Metro Denver Bright Beginnings (MDBB)
  - Home Instruction for Parents of Preschool Youngsters (HIPPY)
  - Parents as Teachers (PAT).
Home Visitation

- **Best Babies** is based on the well-researched and proven Nurse-Family Partnership program which sends a specially trained nurse to meet with “at-risk” mothers every other week for up to two years.

- **Metro Denver Bright Beginnings** (MDBB) sends volunteers into homes for a “Warm Welcome,” offering parents child health information, school readiness games and children’s books.

- **HIPPY** (Home Instruction for Parents of Preschool Youngsters) uses home visitors and group meetings to deliver a school readiness curriculum to children ages 3-5.

- **PAT** (Parents as Teachers) offers personal visits, group meetings and screenings for parents and their children from pregnancy through Kindergarten.
In February 2004, Mayor John Hickenlooper launched his early childhood education initiative called Invest In Success.

The Mayor appointed over 30 business and civic leaders to his Leadership Team on Early Childhood Education. The Team is charged with developing a plan to deliver quality ECE to all of Denver’s children.

The Mayor’s Early Childhood Education Commission (formerly Mayor’s Child Care Advisory Committee) of 15 child care development professionals and parents also is focused on informing the Mayor’s Office on how to reach the goals of the Invest in Success initiative.
Joint Council on Early Childhood Care and Education

Joint Council works toward a more comprehensive city-wide approach to ECE.

- Established in 1990 by DPS and City of Denver. Reports to the Mayor and the Superintendent.

- Created and implemented three 5-year plans for improving early care and education.

- Created uniform ECE Standards in literacy and language, math, science and motor development which are aligned to DPS’s K-12 Standards; spearheaded ESTART.

- Is one of 17 statewide Consolidated Child Care Pilots which can get waivers for cumbersome state regulations.
Qualistar Early Learning is a statewide non-profit organization created to improve the quality of ECE across Colorado.

- Dedicated to creating a fully funded ECE system of high-quality, child-centered ECE that supports parents as teachers and decision makers.
- Offers a voluntary 4-Star Quality Rating System and continuous quality improvement program that measures quality and supplies hundreds of providers with the tools and strategies for success.
- Provides free referrals for parents through a statewide network of 15 Child Care Resource and Referral Agencies.
- Provides education materials for parents on how to find quality child care and why it is so important.
Qualistar Rating System

The Qualistar Rating System is a voluntary system that allows parents to better determine quality ECE for their children. Providers are rated on a four star continuum, with four stars being the highest. Providers are rated on:

- **Learning Environment**
  *The physical setting, interactions between providers and children, activities and materials available, safety, etc.*

- **Family Partnerships**
  *How the provider engages and supports parents as their children’s first teachers through communication, parent education, home learning activities and opportunities for participation and leadership.*

- **Training and Education**
  *To receive high quality ratings, providers must have considerable formal training in early childhood education and classroom experience.*

- **Adult to Child Ratios / Group Size**
  *Programs with more adults available to children generally provide better quality.*

- **Accreditation**
  *Programs that are accredited through a national accrediting agency have engaged in a valuable self-study process and are following national standards of high-quality early childhood education.*
Current Qualistar Ratings

Current Qualistar Ratings for Denver
Child Care Centers and Homes

Total Centers Rated = 42
Total Homes Rated = 4

Highest possible rating

Source: Qualistar as of May 2006
Smart Start Colorado

- Smart Start Colorado is a statewide early childhood alliance working to create an integrated comprehensive early childhood system including ECE, Health and Mental Health, Family Support and Parent Education.

- Led by the Early Childhood State Systems Team, a state-level collaborative of agencies and public and private partners such as CO Children’s Campaign, Head Start, CO Dept. of Education, etc.

- Smart Start Colorado is pursuing 8 goals from program quality to financing.

- www.SmartStartColorado.org
Local Initiatives

- **ESTART** provides standards and assessment tools for DPS and community ECE providers.

- The Clayton Early Childhood Resource Institute provides training and technical assistance to ECE providers and is building a “center of excellence” as a model for Denver.

- Colorado’s School Readiness Indicators Project is part of a 17 state collaborative to create a set of measures – such as immunizations and homelessness – to gauge school readiness of children, their families, schools and communities.
Local Initiatives

- HB1297 and 1238 successfully drew down additional federal Child Care Block Grant dollars delivering over $500K per year for three years to Denver providers to improve quality.

- Policy Matters for School Readiness conducted a state policy audit to identify and recommend legislation, regulations and practices needed for a quality early childhood system.

- The ECE Funders Group is a network of local foundations and Mile High United Way interested in ECE and is affiliated with the Colorado Association of Funders (CAF).
ECE standards tell teachers and parents what 3- and 4-year olds should know and be able to do.

- Early Childhood Standards Assessment for Readiness Tool (ESTART) tracks children’s progress against standards.
  - Tools include pre, mid-year and post tests; individual child and classroom reports; teacher lesson plan ideas; and parent take home activities.
  - Used in 84 classrooms serving 1,254 kids so far.

- Results Matter is a state initiative to ensure program quality and school readiness.
  - Results Matter will measure progress children make during the preschool year
  - This initiative will also measure long term outcomes for children who receive support as young children
Need for Better Data

Our community needs more and better ECE data in order to make more informed decisions.

A sampling of what we DO NOT know:

- DPS savings over time from ECE.
- Actual number of ECE slots specifically for infants and toddlers.
- Local business contributions to ECE.
- Capacity of current providers to provide ECE for *all* of Denver’s children (i.e., training and facilities).
- Quality of current providers who do not receive voluntary Qualistar ratings.